



Approved Minutes
Tuesday, March 5, 2013 – 5:00 P.M.
Special Meeting of the Hartford Parking Authority Board
155 Morgan Street, Hartford, CT 06103

Commissioners Present:

Paddi LeShane, Chair
Kenneth Lerman, Vice Chair
Rex Fowler, Treasurer
William Breetz, Commissioner
Mathew Jasinski, Commissioner

Also Present for HPA:

Mark McGovern, CEO/Executive Director
Carey Redd, Associate Director
John Michalik, Chief Financial Officer
Terry Leonowicz, Secretary to the Board (Director of Revenue Control and Marketing Promotions)
Gina Varano, Assistant Corporation Counsel, City of Hartford

Members of Public Present:

Dan Nash, District Manager, Republic Parking System
Robert Kliman, Real Estate Manager Services, Kay Management Associates

1. **Call to Order** – Ms. LeShane called the Special Meeting of the Hartford Parking Authority (HPA) to order at 5:05 P.M.
2. **Roll Call of Commissioners** – Ms. Leonowicz conducted roll call and announced there was a quorum present.

Mr. Jasinski entered the meeting at 5:09 P.M.

3. **Approval of Minutes of the Regular Meeting of February 22, 2013**
Ms. LeShane polled the Commissioners for amendments to the minutes, and hearing none, called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Breetz, seconded by Mr. Fowler, passing unanimously that –

VOTED: the February 21, 2013 Regular Meeting Minutes were approved as submitted. (ayes - LeShane, Breetz, Lerman, Fowler).

4. **Chair's Comments** – Ms. LeShane noted two (2) action items on the agenda and topics for discussion in Executive Session included preliminary draft of the FY 2013-2014 budget.

Mr. McGovern asked the Commissioners for confirmation of a date to reschedule the April 18th Regular Board meeting as a Special Meeting. All agreed that the meeting will be rescheduled to April 23rd at 5:00 P.M.

REPORTS AND ACTION ITEMS

1. **Property Management Committee** - *Please see Committee Report for details*

a) **Monthly Report** - Mr. Breetz reported that the Committee met on February 26th and discussed the following items: MAT Garage stair tower C project is complete and repairs to Stair tower A and B are being scheduled; review of the capital improvement plan through FY 2015 which will be forwarded to the Finance Committee for review; and the departure of Republic's General Manager, Richard Wagner. Mr. McGovern noted that an interim GM has been assigned and that interviews for a replacement are now being conducted by RPS. Mr. Lerman asked and Mr. McGovern responded that HPA will work with Republic Parking to offer input regarding candidates.

b) **Recommendation to Issue a Request for Response for Construction Services and Repairs to the Library Parking Deck**

Mr. Breetz reported that the Committee is recommending the issuance of a Request for Response for various repairs to the Library parking deck including expansion joint replacement, routing and sealing cracks, application of corrosion inhibitor and LED lighting fixtures to be installed in the lower deck.

Ms. LeShane called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Jasinski to authorize the issuance of an RFR for Library Parking Deck repairs, seconded by Mr. Lerman.

There was discussion regarding the definition of an RFR. Mr. McGovern explained that a "Request for Response" is a general term adopted by the City for a competitive solicitation which could be can be a request for a bid, a proposal, or qualifications, depending on the specific project needs.

Ms. LeShane called the vote and all were in favor to –

VOTED: Authorize the issuance of a Request for Response for repairs to the Hartford Library parking deck. (ayes - LeShane, Lerman, Breetz, Fowler, Jasinski).

c) **Discussion of Off Street Rates**

Mr. McGovern presented the Commissioners with a comparison of the current hourly and monthly parking rates at Church Street (CSG) and MAT Garages versus three (3) comparable facilities in Hartford's Central Business District for discussion and several revised rate schedule options, within the guidelines of the City's ordinance which states HPA's rate must be within 90% of comparable facilities. The code does not define a comparable facility, other than requiring that it be in

the same zoning district. The working group used three (3) facilities with similar locations, size and user groups.

Mr. McGovern stated that the CSG comparison compiled by staff and Republic Parking, shows the existing HPA hourly and monthly rate blocks with transient ticket volume during a sample four (4) month period – excluding event tickets and Hilton Hotel validations. In addition, two (2) rate schedule options were presented and considered – Option A and Option B.

Mr. McGovern explained that there are two (2) corporate monthly accounts which park over one thousand (1000) employees at CSG at a special fixed and CPI-adjusted rate. This would leave only a small percentage of parkers that could be charged a revised monthly rate and was not advantageous enough (revenue-wise) to risk the loss of parkers to competing nearby surface lots which offer lower daily and monthly rates.

The Property Management Committee met and reviewed all data in consideration of a revised hourly and/or monthly rate schedule at Church Street Garage and recommends that rates in both categories remain unchanged.

The Commissioners agreed with this recommendation and no action was taken on rate changes for CSG.

Mr. McGovern then presented the comparison data for MAT Garage compiled by Connecticut Parking Services and staff, to the Commissioners for discussion. This analysis provided two (2) options for the hourly rate adjustment (Option A and Option B) and a third option (Option C) for a monthly rate adjustment taken from a one (1) month representative sample in October.

Mr. McGovern noted that one goal of the analysis was to smooth out the existing rate cliff between 2 and 3 hours which jumps from \$3 to \$10.50, and to have the overall rate buckets adjust more consistently and gradually.

Mr. Kliman provided an explanation of the MAT Garage transient user groups which consist mainly of non-retail visitors to adjoining office buildings in the two (2) hour rate bucket; and the four (4) hour to maximum daily rate buckets. Hartford Stage was not included in the analysis because the majority of their parking patrons pre-pay at a special rate for season parking.

Mr. McGovern stated that Attorney Varano reviewed the current ordinance and required process and made recommendations to include the proposed revised rate schedule as an agenda item for discussion at the next regular Board meeting where public comment could be heard. The proposal could then be put to a vote at the April Board meeting and, if a rate increase was favored, the rate survey

would be made available to the public fifteen (15) days prior to an effective date of July 1st, 2013.

Mr. Kliman noted that many private parking operators may intermittently offer special rates according to fluctuating demand and capacity; rates which are often not publicized. Mr. Jasinski and Mr. Fowler asked if the ordinance defines a "comparable rate" and if it specifies any posting time requirement.

For the record Mr. McGovern read the Municipal Code City of Hartford, CT Ordinance Sec. 10-14 – Powers of the Authority 3. (h):

"Collect and receive all revenue from all parking facilities and revise from time to time, upon approval of the authority following public notice and the opportunity for public comment, the fees, rates, rents or other charges for the use of all parking facilities, services furnished or to be furnished at such parking facilities and parking violations within the city as provided herein. Notwithstanding the foregoing, facility fees, rates, rents or other charges shall not exceed ninety (90) percent of the average fees, rates, rents or other charges for comparable non-authority facilities located in comparable zoning districts within the City. Said average fees, rates, rents or other charges for comparable non-authority facilities shall be determined through periodic surveys conducted by authority staff or consultants. Such surveys shall be made available for public review at the offices of the authority at least fifteen (15) calendar days prior to the increase of any such fees, rates, rents or other charges."

Mr. Lerman suggested taking a more proactive and transparent approach for notifying the public of a proposed revised rate schedule such as using HPA's website, notifying the press or posting signage at the garage in addition to holding a public comment period before the regular Board meeting.

Attorney Varano noted that ordinance states "...following public notice and the opportunity for public comment..." such as how the Authority conducts the monthly Board meetings and does not require any additional advertising other than the website and the Town Clerk's office.

There was further extensive discussion regarding HPA's goal for revising the rates, best practice for notifying the public and the different rate schedules proposed for MAT Garage.

Mr. McGovern said that the Property Management Committee's recommendation is to increase the monthly rate at MAT Garage to \$160 as listed in the Option A rate schedule and for consideration to the Commissioners, however, Ms. LeShane asked for open discussion at the Board Meeting before making a recommendation.

Mr. Breetz commented that HPA should be operated as a business with public service standards, and is best served by maintaining the goal of being self-sustaining in terms of our debt service; and a rate increase would help HPA with that goal. Also, as an economic arm of the City, we would be assisting the City with the budget deficit.

Mr. McGovern stated that a rate increase has not been factored into the initial budget draft submitted to the City and that there would be additional discussion in Executive Session related to the budget.

The Chair recognized Mr. Kliman who stated that the last rate change at MAT Garage by the Authority actually reduced both the hourly and monthly rates with the intention of standardizing rates at HPA facilities. He also stated that at that time the decision to implement a rate jump from \$3 to \$10.50 caused a great deal of public complaints. It was Mr. Kliman's opinion that there would be no loss of parking patrons if an hourly rate increase was implemented because it is relatively small, it removes the cliff and some of the rate buckets in Option A are actually being reduced. In addition, the monthly parking rate increase is still below what the rate was eight (8) years ago, and many of the existing monthly accounts desire more parking spaces than their tenant leases allow.

Mr. Jasinski asked that separate motions be made for monthly and hourly, as he wished to abstain from discussion and vote for the monthly parking rate at MAT since his firm is a paid monthly account there.

A motion was made by Mr. Breetz to approve the advancement of a proposal for purposes of notification and a public comment opportunity for a monthly rate increase at MAT Garage from \$150 to \$160 (Option A of the rate schedule), seconded by Mr. Fowler.

VOTED: Approve the advancement of a proposal for a monthly rate increase at MAT Garage from \$150 to \$160 and for purposes of notification and to allow the opportunity for public comment.

Ayes: Ms. LeShane, Mr. Fowler, Mr. Lerman, Mr. Breetz
 Abstain: Mr. Jasinski

Mr. Breetz then made a motion to approve the advancement of a proposal for an hourly rate adjustment at MAT Garage, as laid out in Option A of the rate schedule and to allow the opportunity for public comment, seconded by Mr. Jasinski.

There was discussion heard regarding the various rate buckets including the zero to one (1) hour parking rate remaining the same versus being raised. Mr. McGovern noted that best practice for Parking Management is to encourage short term parking on-street and long term parking off-street. Ms. LeShane discussed

her thoughts regarding keeping the first rate bucket lower in keeping with the HPA consumer-friendly marketing initiatives. She was supportive of listening to feedback from customers of the garage during public comment on this rate bucket.

Ms. LeShane called the motion and the motion passed.

VOTED: Approve the advancement of a proposal for purposes of notification and public comment opportunity for an hourly rate adjustment at MAT Garage as laid out in Option A of the rate schedule (ayes - Lerman, Breetz, Fowler, Jasinski).

Ayes: Mr. Fowler, Mr. Lerman, Mr. Breetz, Mr. Jasinski
No: Ms. LeShane

There was a consensus to post simple signage at the MAT Garage exit that announces that HPA is considering a rate adjustment at the facility, public comment is welcome at the next regular Board meeting, and more detail can be found on the HPA website.

2. **Personnel Committee**

- a) **Recommendation to Waive the Out of State Travel Restriction for Mr. McGovern to attend the 2013 IPI Annual Conference** - Mr. Lerman reported that the Committee is recommending that a no-travel restriction set by a previous Administration be lifted so that the CEO could attend the parking industry's largest Conference and Trade Show by the International Parking Institute which will be held in Fort Lauderdale, FL in May. Mr. Jasinski asked about the conference agenda and expense and Mr. McGovern responded that there were a variety of current parking industry topics, professional development opportunities and that \$2500 was budgeted for the 4-day trip. Mr. Lerman also suggested that the Committee review the existing policy at the next meeting.

Ms. LeShane called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Breetz, passing unanimously that –

VOTED: The current out of state travel restriction is waived for the CEO to attend the 2013 IPI conference and that the Personnel Committee will review the existing policy and make recommendations at the next Board Meeting. (ayes - LeShane, Breetz, Lerman, Fowler, Jasinski).

3. **Finance Committee**

- a) **Review of Preliminary Draft of the 2013-2014 Budget**

Discussion of this agenda item was held for Executive Session

OPEN SESSION – PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Kliman thanked the Commissioners for the opportunity to discuss the rates and Ms. LeShane thanked both Mr. Kliman and Mr. Nash for the valuable input.

EXECUTIVE SESSION**1. Contract Considerations, Litigation and Preliminary Draft of FY 2013-2014 Budget**

Ms. LeShane called for a motion to enter into Executive session at 6:35 P.M. and a motion was made by Mr. Breetz, seconded by Mr. Lerman, passing unanimously (ayes- LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski, Fowler, Breetz).

Mr. McGovern, Mr. Michalik and Ms. Varano remained for the Executive Session.

Mr. Fowler departed the meeting at 7:20 P.M.

Executive Session ended and the Regular Meeting reconvened at 7:25 P.M.

ADJOURNMENT

There was no action taken in Executive Session.

Ms. LeShane called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Breetz, passing unanimously (ayes - LeShane, Lerman, Breetz, Jasinski). The March 5, 2013 Special Meeting ended at 7:25 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

Terry Leonowicz

Terry Leonowicz
Secretary to the Board