



Approved Minutes Thursday, September 26th, 2014 – 1:30 P.M. Special Meeting of the Hartford Parking Authority Board 155 Morgan Street, Hartford, CT 06103

Commissioners Present:

Paddi LeShane, Chair Ken Lerman, Vice Chair Mat Jasinski, Commissioner

Also Present for HPA:

Eric M. Boone, CEO/Executive Director Carey E. Redd, Associate Director Michael DesRoches, Director of Finance and Administration Gina Varano, Assistant Corporation Counsel, City of Hartford

Guests: Dan Nash, Regional Manager, Republic Parking

Kyle Nichols, General Manager, Republic Parking

- **1.** <u>Call to Order</u> Ms. LeShane called the September 26thth, 2014 Special Board Meeting of the Hartford Parking Authority ("Authority" or "HPA") to order at 1:56 P.M.
- **2. Roll Call of Commissioners** Mr. Redd conducted roll call and announced there was a quorum.
- **Approval of the Regular Board Meeting Minutes for July 17th, 2014** Ms. LeShane polled the Commissioners for amendments and corrections noting the discrepancy in the dates on the Residential Parking Permit Regulations and 1212 Main and 58 Chapel Surface Lots Public Hearings Minutes and that of the September 26th, 2014 Agenda. Mr. Redd confirmed the Public Hearings were held Monday, July 14th, 2014.

A motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Jasinski that -

VOTED: The July 17th, 2014 Regular Board Meeting Minutes were approved as submitted and with the necessary corrections be made to the September 26th, 2014 Agenda. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman) (Abstain: Jasinski)

4. Approval of the Residential Parking Permit Regulations Public Hearing Minutes for July 14th, 2014 - Ms. LeShane polled the Commissioners for amendments and corrections to the minutes and hearing none called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Jasinski that -

VOTED: The July 14th, 2014 Residential Parking Permit Regulations Public Hearing minutes were approved as submitted. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

5. Approval of the 1212 Main Street and 58 Chapel Street Surface Lots Public Hearing Minutes for July 14th, 2014 - Ms. LeShane polled the Commissioners for amendments and corrections to the minutes and hearing none called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Jasinski that -

VOTED: The July 14th, 2014 1212 Main Street and 58 Chapel Street Surface Lots Public Hearing minutes were approved as submitted. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

Chair's Comments – Ms. LeShane stated that the summer months were very busy due to the announcement to build a baseball stadium in Hartford, the pending Church Street Garage sale to the Capital Region Development Authority and awarding surface lots management contracts. Ms. LeShane suggested the Strategic Retreat be moved to a date prior to the October 16th, 2014 Board meeting. She would poll the Commissioners and work with Mr. Boone to establish a date.

Mr. Boone spoke admirably about the birth of his new son, Marshall. Ms. LeShane noted Mr. Boone would be on paternal leave until October 6th, 2014.

REPORTS AND ACTION ITEMS

Ms. LeShane as agreed by the Personnel Committee stated that there was nothing to report

Finance Committee – Please see the Financial Report for details
 Ms. LeShane stated that in Treasurer's Fowler's absence Mr. DesRoches would present the Finance Committee.

Monthly Report – Mr. DesRoches continued stating the year-to-date results through August 31, 2014 were \$631,076 of operating income compared to the \$499,355 budget, a favorable variance of \$131,741; revenues were up to \$1,526,283 compared to a budget of \$1,432,208, a favorable variance of \$94,075; and \$895,207 of expenses were below the \$932,873 budgeted, a favorable variance of \$37,666.

Mr. DesRoches stated that one of his objectives is to analyze and report on the accrued liabilities seasonal changes during the year. In response to Ms. LeShane's inquiry, Mr. Boone noted greater financial detail would be reviewed for better analysis of the accrual and cash line items but the procedures for month to month reporting are not being changed. Mr. DesRoches added the financial report will account for seasonality and year to year comparisons of the line items in response to Mr. Jasinski's inquiry.

Ms. LeShane with agreement from the Commissioners request the financial report show month over month and year over year growth comparisons or downturns which Mr. DesRoches acknowledged.

Mr. Boone stated that the Collection Rate improved largely due to the Boot Program and the Collection Agency's efforts, however the trend would level off in the months ahead. He continued stating that issued citations are a major component of the collection rate statistic and there was a 1,200 citations downturn that month from the prior year. Mr. Boone stated that the construction in the Central Business District, Republic's staff realignment to implement the Boot Program and the staffs' enforcement production as compared to past performance were factors that influenced the weakness which Mr. Nichols agreed. Mr. Nichols noted he had discussed the staff's performance with Republic's personnel.

Ms. LeShane stated that the staffs' performance should be separated from the revenue increases then asked if the report suggest that Mr. Breetz, Chairman, Property Management (PM) Committee, HPA and her concerns are being addressed which was affirmed by Mr. Nichols and Mr. Boone.

Mr. Jasinski asked Mr. Boone to provide him with the definition of a parking citation Appeal. Mr. Boone stated an Appeal is an active protest of a citation to a City of Hartford (City) Hearing Officer. Mr. Jasinski stated that the report gives the appearance that the number of Appeals have escalated but in fact they were closed out which the HPA and Republic staffs affirmed. Mr. Nichols stated that

the HPA and Republic staffs were exploring the alternative methods to measure on-street parking compliance and Appeals to present better.

In response Mr. Jasinski's comments, Mr. Nichols stated that the number of citations dismissed when appealed had decreased since the dismissal volume was brought to the attention of the Corporation Counsel last year and they were more in line with the industry. Ms. LeShane added the HPA and Republic staffs worked with the Hearing Officers to update the guidelines and procedures to dismiss citations. Mr. Nichols continued stating that Cynthia Lauture's, Assistant Corporation Counsel, City of Hartford oversight of the Citation Hearing Office has brought an understanding of the adjudication process that did not exist before which has contributed significantly to the reduction in the number of dismissed citations.

Ms. LeShane polled the Commissioners for further discussion on the Finance Committee Report and hearing none called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Jasinski, seconded by Mr. Lerman, passing unanimously to -

VOTED: Accept the September 2014 Finance Report as submitted. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

- 2. Marketing Committee Ms. LeShane stated that there were two items requiring action as follows.
 - a. Approval of the Extension of the Dornenburg Group LLC Contract Ms. LeShane stated that the first recommendation was for continuation of the Authority and Dornenburg Group LLC On-call Marketing Services Contract Agreement. She stated that Dornenburg's services are provided to the HPA based on an hourly rate schedule as required, the HPA does not have to make an upfront or long term financial commitment and Dornenburg has done a fabulous job assisting the HPA with its branding and marketing efforts within the approved budget as agreed by the HPA staff.

Ms. LeShane made a motion, seconded by Mr. Lerman, passing unanimously to –

VOTED: Extend the Dornenburg Group LLC Contract for one (1) additional one (1) year. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

b. Approval of Northeast Utilities (NU) Marathon Parking Pricing - Ms. LeShane stated that the second recommendation was in response to the NU Marathon's request for a \$5 parking rate in the HPA's parking facilities {1212 Main Street, 58 Chapel Street, 141 Sheldon Street, 166 Sheldon Street, MAT Garage and Church Street Garage (CSG)} for the public and up to one hundred (100) free parking spaces in the CSG for their volunteers on Saturday, October 11th, 2014. She added the request is in line with that of previous years. She noted the discounted parking event rate would continue henceforth until the HPA decide to adjust it.

In response to Mr. Lerman's inquiry, Ms. LeShane stated that the parking garages and surface lots were priced the same which is consistent with discounted parking event rates for other events held in the City of Hartford such as the UCONN parade as agreed by the HPA staff. Mr. Boone noted a parking map identifying all of the NU Marathon supporters' parking facilities offering the discounted parking event rate will be placed on their web-site.

Ms. LeShane call a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Jasinski, passing unanimously to –

VOTED: Offer discounted parking event rates at the HPA's parking facilities. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

3. Property Management Committee – *Please see the Financial Report for details.*

Ms. LeShane with the concurrence of the Commissioners stated that the Property Management (PM) Committee would take up the two items requiring action and forego the Monthly Report.

a. Approval of Citation Database Citation Management Recommendations – Ms. LeShane complimented the HPA and Republic staffs' work on the aged citation database discussed in recent PM Committee meetings. She added the HPA inherited the majority of the aged citations after assuming responsibility for on-street revenue collections and in Mr. Breetz's absence Mr. Boone would present the PM Committee Report.

Mr. Boone stated that the citation database has 550k paid and unpaid citations. He added the citation database outstanding citations are valued at \$20.8M, the raw data shows the majority of the citations were from 2000 on and 305k citations have an amount due. In response to Commissioners' inquiry, Mr. Boone stated that paid citations are maintained for historical reasons. He continued stating that there were two distinct positive shifts in the quality of the data as shown in the decision analytic prepared:

- The first shift occurred when the HPA assumed on-street parking responsibility.
- The second shift occurred when Republic became the HPA's on-street parking contractor.

Mr. Boone stated that prior to the Authority acquiring responsibility for on-street parking in 2006, mechanisms did not exist to assist in the management and or understanding of the citation database; therefore, his research focused on three fundamental questions:

- 1. What fines were actually due for payment and which citations were recorded in error?
- 2. Which citations were collectible and which were not?
- 3. Which citations were worth the effort to pursue and which were not?

Mr. Boone stated that based on the waterfall decision results, the Authority's Board with Corporation Counsel's and appropriate parties concurrence will be able to recommend which citations to write off, sell off or are collectable.

Mr. Boone stated that a secondary objective was to research reputable firms willing to purchase the assets and not use collection tactics that would impugn the City or Authority's reputation.

Ms. LeShane stated that the PM Committee's research resulted from City Council's multiple requests to determine if the assets could be sold. She added first request came forth in the 2012 Budget Hearing. She stated that the research conveys the Authority performed due diligence in response to the City Council's requests.

Mr. Boone continued by stating if the Board supports the PM Committee's recommendation to sell citation database assets value at an estimated \$10M, the Authority could realize approximately \$300k which the Commissioners agreed is worth pursuing researching the opportunity to sell. Ms. LeShane stated alternatively to continue collect efforts using current means would not result in any significant result.

Mr. Boone, as Corporation Counsel agreed, stated that the State of Connecticut (ST of CT) Department of Motor Vehicle (DMV) prohibits the sale of the registrant's information {name, address, city and state} to third parties, in response to Ms. LeShane's inquiry. Ms. LeShane acknowledged the restriction then stated that her experience has been third party collectors have entered into separate agreement to acquire the registrant's information with the DMV. Mr. Nichols added debt collectors have means to acquire registrant information without getting it from the DMV. Ms. LeShane with the

Commissioners' concurrence stated that the aged citation debt sale would be discussed at a later date then asked Mr. Boone to continue with the PM Committee's recommendations to be act upon.

Mr. Boone stated that the decision analytic defines the citation database debt. He added the errors accounted for \$1.65M of which 99% occurred prior to 2006, \$88k of the debt was from registrants not notified in accordance with the DMV regulations and \$60k of the debt resulted from citations issued to vehicle plates that were stolen.

In response to Attorney Varano's inquiry, Mr. Redd stated that the City's Department of Public Works and Tax Collector performed citation noticing and revenue collections prior to the Authority assuming the responsibility in February 2006. He said the Authority modified the Notice procedures to comply with DMV regulations. Ms. LeShane added that debt collection was not performed by a professional organization which lead to process errors and non-compliance with DMV regulations.

Ms. LeShane called for motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Jasinski, passing unanimously to –

VOTED: Authorize the CEO/Executive Director to write off \$1.79M of aged parking citation debt contingent on the approval of the appropriate parties' {i.e., City Council, City of Hartford, and Corporation Counsel} agreement thereof. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

Mr. Boone stated that the second recommendation to the Board was to sell some of the aged citation debt to a qualified and reputable collector. He said that while no other municipality in the ST of CT has sold their citation assets, the Authority could make such a decision based on the following:

- 1. There is no likelihood to collect the debt for citations issued prior to 2002 which is valued at \$2.88M. The motorists were not noticed in accordance with DMV regulations and judgments were not entered to protect the City's rights.
- 2. Many of the registrants' physical addresses for citations issued between 2002 and 2010 are not known because the motorists have moved without leaving forwarding addresses thus the collection achievability is remote (valued at \$2.36M).
- 3. The HPA chance of collecting debt on non-commercial out-of-state citations issued between 2002 and 2011 which is valued at \$275k is slim to none. However, the HPA would continue its efforts to collect on the commercial citations issued to rental and leasing companies which has showed promise.

Mr. Boone added that additional refinement of the citation database resulted in recommendations to:

- 1. Sell all citations over ten years old issued between 2002 and 2004 which is valued at \$2.72M.
- 2. Sell all citations issued between 2002 and 2010 for motorists with only one citation which is valued at \$1.82M.
- 3. Sell all citation issued between 2002 and 2010 for motorists who have more than one citation but owe less than \$100 debt owed to the City which is valued at \$90k.

Mr. Boone stated the total value of the citation debt the PM Committee recommend to sell is approximately \$9.35M. He added that the Authority could "clean up" the citation database realizing approximately \$300k from citation sales.

Ms. LeShane stated that the PM Committee felt if staff could identify a firm that could effectuate the aged citation collections listed in numbers 4 thru 6 of the recommendation while maintaining the Authority's reputation, it would be worth selling the assets. She added the PM Committee's recommendation would be to instruct the staff to research the industry for such a firm, determine if selling the asset is in the best interest of the HPA and report its findings at the October 2014 Regular Board meeting in response to Mr. Lerman's comments.

Ms. LeShane as agreed with Mr. Boone stated that items 7 thru 9 of the recommendation was more of a "nuisance" and the Board would have to decide whether or not it was worth the effort to continue its pursuit of this debt. She stated that if the Authority was not going to sell items 4, 5 and 6 then 7, 8 and 9 would not be sold either.

Mr. Boone noted that if the Authority sells the aged citation debt, the current unpaid citations will be reduced from 305k to 131k, its value will be reduced to \$10.3, the number of motorist drops from 85k to 57k and the number of scofflaws drop to 4,500 which is roughly half of the current total and equals Republic's assertion the Authority 4,500 scofflaws to collect from with a value of \$2.7M. Mr. Boone noted that the data analysis supports these conclusions.

In response to Mr. Lerman comments about keeping the scofflaw list, Ms. LeShane as agreed with Mr. Jasinski who stated that the scofflaw debt would only be collectable on citations that were not sold.

Mr. Boone stated that the database maintains each vehicle which is registered with the DMV that receives a parking citation in the City of Hartford in response to Mr. Jasinski's inquiry which was affirmed by Mr. Redd and the Republic staff.

Ms. LeShane stated that the objective of the analysis was to systematically clean up the citation database. Mr. Boone stated that the decision analytic would be incorporated into the on-line system to determine the actual citations that would be either written off, sold and or maintained.

In response, Mr. Lerman inquiry if the database could be further defined in the years that predate Republic's on-street parking management agreement, Mr. Redd stated that this may present a significant challenge because previous vendor's system did not have the functionality to perform the type of analysis the current vendor provides.

Mr. Lerman and Ms. LeShane's request a further breakdown of issued citations between 2002 and 2010 for motorist who have only one citation to which Mr. Boone pointed out that the breakdown would not change the outcome because judgments were filed which Mr. Jasinski.

Attorney Varano as agreed with Mr. Jasinski stated that municipal debt is not one of the defined entities of consumer debt thus it is not subject to the Federal Fair Debt Collection Practices Act regulations in response Mr. Lerman inquiry as to the options available to a collector that buys the Authority's aged debt and Ms. LeShane's comments. Attorney Varano stated that she would research the Act further in preparation of the October, 2014 Regular Board meeting.

Ms. LeShane as agreed with the Commissioners instructed the HPA and Republic staffs to:

- Investigate the feasibility of selling the aged citation assets as recommend.
- 2. Work with the appropriate parties in the City to determine the mechanism for such a sale.
- 3. Determine the actions or options the purchaser can take in its debt collection effort.
- 4. Prepare a list restrictions that can be impose on the collector to ensure the HPA's reputation.
- 5. Provide a breakdown unpaid citations issue between 2002 and 2010 for motorist who have only one citation.
- 6. Report the findings at the PM Committee and Regular Board meetings in October 2014.

Attorney Varano noted that the City Council would have to approve any sale of City assets which the Commissioners agreed.

Ms. LeShane reported that the PM Committee instructed the HPA and Republic staffs to acquire and present the different criteria used by ST of CT municipalities to define scofflaws then prepare definition change recommendation.

Mr. Boone stated that numerous ST of CT municipalities define scofflaws based on dollar amounts instead of the number of parking citations like Hartford. He stated that there were three scofflaw thresholds in the municipalities with \$200 as the medium. He noted that if Hartford define a scofflaw as owing \$200 in citation fines, the value of that debt is \$4.89M which will affect 12,065 registrants. He stated if Hartford aggressively define a scofflaw as owing \$100 in citation fines, the value of those citations would be \$6.81M which will affect 23,580 registrants.

Mr. Lerman as agreed with the Commissioners request a chart/report showing comparisons of Hartford's fine schedules and collection efforts to other CT municipalities from the HPA staff.

Ms. LeShane stated of any change in scofflaw definition would be implemented going forward and take effect July 1st which was agreed by the Commissioners, HPA and Republic staffs.

Mr. Lerman as agreed by the Commissioners stated that while a change to a dollar amount would result in an increase debt collection, reducing the number of unpaid citations possibly to three would be a clearer approach and the Authority should retain the number of unpaid citations as the standard. Mr. Boone noted three citations including penalties is approximately the same as the \$200 threshold; therefore, the Authority could still achieve its goal. Ms. LeShane stated that a timeframe should be added to the recommendation which Mr. Boone acknowledged.

In response to Mr. Nichols comments concerning Mr. Breetz's ideas, Ms. LeShane stated that the Authority would have to determine if it were legal to impose the change in definition on multiple vehicles with unpaid parking citations and accumulated numeric per vehicle is below the threshold if it was agreed that threshold be reduced to a number below five parking citations. Mr. Boone stated that the ST of CT leaves that decision to the municipalities because their restriction applies to the registrant's vehicle only.

Ms. LeShane with the concurrence of the Commissioners complimented the HPA and Republic staffs on its research and asked Mr. Boone to forgo the PM Committee Monthly Report to leave ample time to discuss two subjects in Executive Session.

b. Approval of Brazilian Consulate On-Street Parking Recommendation - Ms. LeShane stated that the PM Committee recommendation approval of on-street parking for the Brazilian Diplomat and not the Consulate staff. In Response to the Commissioner's comments, M. Redd stated only two diplomatic plate has been identified.

Ms. LeShane as agreed by Commissioners and Corporation Counsel stated that the Authority does not have a policy which allows for free on-street parking to be offered by the HPA and the recommendation was to provide on-street parking for the sole purpose of a Foreign Consulate use should be tabled.

Ms. LeShane call a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Jasinski, seconded by Mr. Lerman, passing unanimously to –

VOTED: Table the Recommendation for Approval of Brazilian Consulate On-Street Parking. (Ayes: LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

- **4. By-laws and Revisions Committee** In response to Ms. LeShane's comments, Mr. Jasinski stated that he did not have anything to report. Mr. Redd stated that he would research the minutes to determine what policies were to be reviewed and or updated by the By-laws Committee and report the same to Mr. Jasinski.
- **5. CEO Update** *Please see the Financial Report for details*Due to time constraints Mr. Boone's update was not presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Ms. LeShane opened the floor to additional public comment and there was none.

EXECUTIVE SESSION – Ms. LeShane called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Jasinski, seconded by Mr. Lerman, passing unanimously to –

VOTED: Enter into Executive Session to discuss matters related to the Church Street Garage contract negotiations and 1212 Main Street & 58 Chapel Street contract and property sale. (Ayes – LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

Mr. Boone and Attorney Varano attended the Executive Session.

Ms. LeShane called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Jasinski, passing unanimously to –

VOTED: Adjourn the Executive Session at 4:20P.M. (Ayes – LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

No action was taken related to the Executive Session.

ADJOURNMENT

Ms. LeShane called for a motion and a motion was made by Mr. Lerman, seconded by Mr. Jasinski, passing unanimously that the September 26th, 2014 Special Board Meeting ended at 4:20 P.M. (Ayes – LeShane, Lerman, Jasinski)

Respectfully submitted,

Carey E. Redd, 99. CAPP

Carey E. Redd, II, CAPP Secretary to the Board